

**In the Supreme Court of New Zealand**

**SC 40/2008**

between

**New Zealand Big Game Fishing Council Inc**

First Appellant

and

**New Zealand Recreational Fishing Council Inc**

Second Appellant

and

**Sanford Limited, Sealord Group Limited and Pelegic & Tuna New Zealand Limited**

First Respondents

and

**Minister of Fisheries**

Second Respondent

and

**The Chief Executive of the Ministry of Fisheries**

Third Respondent

**Case on Appeal**

**Dated: November 2008**

---

Appellants' Solicitors  
HESKETH HENRY  
*Barristers & Solicitors*  
41 Shortland Street, PO Box 92093,  
Auckland, New Zealand  
Telephone 64-4-494 5602. Facsimile  
64-4-494 5680. DX SP20208

*Reference:* Stuart Ryan  
*Email:*  
stuart.ryan@heskethenry.co.nz  
*Senior Counsel:* Alan Galbraith QC  
*Email:*  
argalbraith@shortlandchambers.co.nz

First Respondents' Solicitors  
CHAPMAN TRIPP  
*Barristers & Solicitors*  
10 Customhouse Quay,  
PO Box 933, Wellington, New Zealand  
Telephone: 04 499 5999  
Facsimile: 04 472 7111, DX 20204

*Reference:* Bruce Scott / Geoff Carter  
*Email:* bruce.scott@chapmantripp.com  
geoff.carter@chapmantripp.com

Second and Third Respondent's Solicitors  
CROWN LAW OFFICE  
Barristers & Solicitors  
PO Box 2858, Wellington, New Zealand

*Reference:* Peter McCarthy/Sara Ritchie  
*Email:* peter.mccarthy@crownlaw.govt.nz

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Volume 1

No.	Date	Description	Page
<b>PLEADINGS AND JUDGMENT UNDER APPEAL</b>			
1.	22/12/05	Merged Pleadings – Amended Statement of Claim of Plaintiffs and Respondents statements of defence	0001
2.	21/03/07	Judgment of Harrison J	0036
3.	26/09/07	Sealed Judgment of High Court	0063
4.	11/07/07	Judgment of Harrison J on Stay	0065
5.	11/6/2008	Judgment of Court of Appeal CA163/07	0070
6.	9/7/2008	Application for Leave to Appeal by New Zealand Big Game Fishing Council Inc	0110
7.	3/9/2008	Application by New Zealand Recreational Fishing Council for leave to appeal	0115
8.	2/10/2008	Judgment of the Supreme Court on application for leave to bring appeal	0120

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

**Volume 2**

<b>No.</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Page</b>
<b>BUNDLE OF AFFIDAVITS</b>			
9.	10/08/05	Affidavit of Raniera TeiTinga Tau (Sonny) in support of application for review	0123
10.	12/08/05	Affidavit of Keith Luke Ingram in support of application for review	0131
11.	12/08/05	Affidavit of Jeffery Allan Romeril in support of application for review	0147
12.	26/08/05	Affidavit of Kim Andrew Robert Walshe in support of application for review	0160
13.	26/08/05	Affidavit of Jonathan Clive Holdsworth in support of application for review (first)	0199
14.	01/03/06	Affidavit of Richard Owen Boyd in support of plaintiffs first amended statement of claim (second)	0270
15.	24/04/06	Affidavit of Kevin Laurence Murray	0282
16.	26/04/06	Affidavit of Peter George Reid	0288
17.	02/05/06	Affidavit of Paul Joseph Starr in opposition to application for review and in support of third respondents' counterclaim (first)	0295

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**  
**Volume 3**

<b>No.</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Page</b>
<b>BUNDLE OF AFFIDAVITS</b>			
18.	04/05/06	Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson in opposition to plaintiffs' application for review and in support of third defendants' counterclaim (first)	0322
19.	02/10/06	Affidavit of Kevin George Rintoul in reply	0410
20.	04/10/06	Affidavit of David Benson Pope in opposition to application for review	0413
21.	18/10/06	Affidavit in reply of Paul Daniel Louis Barnes	0452
22.	19/10/06	Affidavit in reply of Jonathan Clive Holdsworth (second)	0458
23.	30/10/06	Affidavit of James Patrick Anderton in opposition to application for review	0469
24.	03/11/06	Reply affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson in opposition to plaintiffs' application for review and in support of third defendants' counterclaim (second)	0471
25.	26/10/06	Affidavit of Paul Joseph Starr in opposition to plaintiffs' application for review and in support of third defendants' counterclaim (second)	0490

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Volume 4

No.	Date	Description	Page
<b>EXHIBITS – KEY DOCUMENTS</b>			
26.	29/06/04	Final Advice on setting on sustainability and other management controls for Kahawai stocks to be introduced into the QMS on 1 October 2004 incorporating:	0503
		- Kahawai (KAH) Initial Position Paper (“2004 IPP”) Exhibit JH 3, 1st Affidavit of Jonathan Clive Holdsworth	0527
		- Kahawai (KAH) Final advice (“2004 Final advice”), Exhibit JH 3, 1st Affidavit of Jonathan Clive Holdsworth	
		- Final recommendations, decision by Minister of Fisheries – David Benson Pope, Exhibit JH1, 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Jonathan Clive Holdsworth	0623
27.	10/08/04	Letter to stakeholder from David Benson-Pope re Setting of sustainability measures for Kahawai Stocks to be introduced into the Quota Management System on 1 October 2004, Exhibit “VW-1” 1st Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson; also Exhibit JH 2, 1st Affidavit of Jonathan Clive Holdsworth	0636
28.	14/09/05	Final Advice Paper on Review of sustainability matters and other management controls for the 2005-06 (1 October) fishing year – extracts relating to kahawai, incorporating:	0642
		- Kahawai (KAH 1-10) Initial Position Paper (“2005 IPP”) Exhibit B, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Affidavit of Richard Owen Boyd; also Exhibit JH5, 1st Affidavit of Jonathan Clive Holdsworth	0728
		- Kahawai (KAH 1-10) Final Advice (“2005 Final Advice”) Exhibit B, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Affidavit of Richard Owen Boyd; also Exhibit JH5, 1st Affidavit of Jonathan Clive Holdsworth	
		- Final recommendations for Final Advice Paper on Review of sustainability matters and other management controls for the 2005-06 (1 October) fishing year	0823a-0823m
29.	00/00/05	Letter to stakeholder from Jim Anderton re Review of sustainability measures and other managements controls for the 2005-2006 fishing year, Exhibit “VW-1” 1st Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson; also Exhibit A Affidavit of David Benson Pope, Exhibit A, 2nd affidavit of Richard Owen Boyd, and Exhibit PJS-7, 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Paul Joseph Starr	0824

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Volume 5

No.	Date	Description	Page
<b>EXHIBITS IN CHRONOLOGICAL ORDER</b>			
30.	00/06/89	National policy for Marine Recreational Fisheries, Exhibit A Affidavit of David Benson Pope	0834
31.	00/00/99	Report "Comparison of marine recreational fishing harvest rates and fish size distributions" E. Bradford, NIWA Technical Reports 48, 1999, Exhibit A, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Affidavit of Jonathan Clive Holdsworth	0845
32.	01/05/01	Paper, Ministry of Fisheries, Business Group – "Recreational Fishing Rights" Exhibit A, 3rd Affidavit of Richard Owen Boyd, Vol 2	0896
33.	00/06/01	Draft Working Paper for Discussion – Recreational Fishing Reforms: Improved Information, Exhibit "VW-3", 2 <sup>nd</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	0904
34.	00/09/02	Report "Review of harvest estimates from recent New Zealand national marine recreational fishing surveys" by Professor Robert E. Kearney, Exhibit "B", 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Peter Robin Todd	0910
35.	00/08/03	Final Research Report for Ministry of Fisheries Research Project KAH 2000/01 Objective 1 – "Length and age compositions of recreational landings of Kahawai in KAH 1 in 2000-01, 2001-02 and 2002-03", Exhibit B, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Affidavit of Jonathan Clive Holdsworth	0938
36.	06/11/03	Letter to Stakeholder re Decisions regarding stocks to be introduced into the Quota Management System on 1 October 2004 (Declaration Notice), Exhibit "VW-1" 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	0977
	05/03/04	Briefing for the Minister of Fisheries, Exhibit A, Affidavit of David Benson Pope	0982
37.	16/04/04	NZ Recreational Fishing Council submission re introduction of Kahawai into the Quota Management System on October 1 2004, Exhibit K11 Affidavit of Keith Luke Ingham	1008
38.	16/04/04	Submission on behalf of non-commercial fishers re Introduction of new species into Quota Management System (different version of preceding document), with one appendix and two documents annexed Exhibit "VW-1" 1 <sup>st</sup> affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1020
39.	16/04/04	Mace & Company Limited submission re Introduction of kahawai into the Quota Management System. Submission on behalf of Sanford Limited, Exhibit "VW-1" 1 <sup>st</sup> affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1054

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Volume 6

No.	Date	Description	Page
<b>EXHIBITS IN CHRONOLOGICAL ORDER</b>			
40.	30/04/04	Report from Mark Edwards MAF attaching Ministry of Fisheries briefing notes for participation in radio network talk-back session, Exhibit A, Affidavit of David Benson Pope	1088
41.	00/05/04	Report from the Fishery Assessment Plenary, May 2004: Stock Assessment and yield estimates. Part 1: Albacore to Ling. Science Group, Ministry of Fisheries, Exhibit PJS-1, 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Paul Joseph Starr	1096
42.	01/05/04	Newztel News Agency Ltd transcript of 'The Fishing Breakfast' 01/05/04, Exhibit A, affidavit of David Benson Pope	1114
43.	02/07/04	Hon David Benson-Pope to Recreational Fishing Council, Plans for the fishery in the future, Exhibit A, Affidavit of David Benson Pope	1135
44.	10/08/04	Press statement of Minister: Cautious kahawai decisions recognize recreational fishers' interest, Exhibit "VW-1" 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson, Vol 2; Exhibit PJS-6, 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Paul Joseph Starr	1141
45.	30/08/04	Letter to Minister of Fisheries from Michael Arbuckle attaching report re kahawai management – Fisheries Amendment Bill (No 3), Exhibit "VW-1" 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1142
46.	01/11/04	Paper from Tom Chatterton to Hon David Benson-Pope attaching briefing notes re Kahawai – Information available for a review of catch limits and allowances, enclosing Kahawai medium term research plan, Exhibit A Affidavit of David Benson Pope also Exhibit "VW-1" 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1145
47.	05/11/04	Report from Mark Edwards MAF to Minister re Current situation regarding management of recreational fisheries, Exhibit A Affidavit of David Benson Pope	1162
48.	05/11/04	Report from Arthur Hore MAF to Minister of Fisheries re Kahawai – Proposal for reviewing the recreational daily bag limit, Exhibit "VW-1" 1 <sup>st</sup> affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1168
49.	08/12/04	Email from Arthur Hore to Steve Hurring re Kahawai, Exhibit A Affidavit of David Benson Pope	1173
50.	08/12/04	Email from Mark Edwards to Stan Crothers and Michael Arbuckle re FW: Anglers win battle in Kahawai war, Exhibit "VW-1" 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1174

<b>No.</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Description</b>	<b>Page</b>
51.	13/12/04	Report from Tom Chatterton to Minister of Fisheries re Kahawai – Recreational bag limits, Exhibit “VW-1” 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1176
52.	13/12/04	Press statement of Minister: No change to bag limits for recreational kahawai fisher, says Minister, Exhibit “VW-1” 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1180
53.	27/5/2005	Report of the Fishery Assessment Plenary 2005 (extract) for kahawai	1181
54.	10/06/05	Report from Arthur Hore to David Benson Pope re Kahawai – review of 2004 decisions on catch limits and allowances, annotated, Exhibit “VW-1” 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1187
55.	28/06/05	Report from Mark Edwards to David Benson Pope re Policy on stock levels to improve recreational fishing with one appendix, Exhibit A Affidavit of David Benson Pope	1193
56.	00/07/05	Report from the Ministry of Fisheries, Science Group re Marine Recreational Fisheries, Draft medium term research plan 2005-2008 – Exhibit E, 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Peter Robin Todd	1200
57.	04/07/05	Press statement of Hon David Benson-Pope: Recreational fishers get “hotline” to government, Exhibit A Affidavit of David Benson Pope	1208
58.	06/07/05	Report from Arthur Hore to David Benson Pope re Kahawai – proposal to review management measures, Exhibit “VW-1” 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1210
59.	07/07/05	Letter from Tom Chatterton to David Benson Pope attaching draft Initial Position Paper: review of sustainability measures and other management controls for kahawai for the 2005-2006 fishing year, Exhibit “VW-1” 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1219
60.	08/07/05	Speech to the 2005 NZ Recreational Fishing Council AGM and Conference from Hon David Benson-Pope Exhibit “VW-1” 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson; also Exhibit JH4, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Affidavit of Jonathan Clive Holdsworth	1251
61.	08/07/05	Media statement re Minister signals new approach to key shared species from Hon David Benson-Pope, Exhibit “VW-1” Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1260

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### Volume 7

No.	Date	Description	Page
<b>EXHIBITS IN CHRONOLOGICAL ORDER</b>			
62.	00/08/05	Non-Commercial Fisheries, Chronology of Research 1997/98 to 2005/06, Exhibit A, 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Peter Robin Todd	1261
63.	23/08/05	Document re Proportionality in allocation of the TAC, Exhibit A, Affidavit of Paul Daniel Louis Barnes; also Exhibit "VW-3", 2 <sup>nd</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1284
64.	05/09/05	Letter from Tim Persen to Owen Symmans re customary fishing rights with two tables attached, Exhibit "VW-1" 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1287
65.	20/09/05	Briefing for the Minister of Fisheries, Exhibit "VW-3", 2 <sup>nd</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1291
66.	30/09/05	Press statement of Minister: New regulations for the 2005/06 fishing year, Exhibit A Affidavit of David Benson Pope; also Exhibit "VW-1" 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson	1293
67.	16/12/05	Ministry of Fisheries report to Minister re Shared fisheries policy development, Exhibit "VW-1" 1 <sup>st</sup> Affidavit of Vaughan Wilkinson; also Exhibit E, Affidavit of John Mark Raymond Edwards and Exhibit C, 2 <sup>nd</sup> Affidavit of Richard Owen Boyd	1295
68.	00/04/06	Final research report for Minister of Fisheries re Length and age compositions of recreational landings of kahawai in KAH 1 in January to April 2003-04 and 2004-05, Exhibit C, 2 <sup>nd</sup> affidavit of Jonathan Clive Holdsworth	1307
69.	19/10/06	Public discussion paper: Future management of shared fisheries, Exhibit B Affidavit of J P Anderton	1344
70.	00/11/06	Public Discussion Paper from Ministry of Fisheries re Shared fisheries – Proposals for managing New Zealand's shared fisheries, Exhibit A, Affidavit of James Patrick Anderton	1360
71.	22/2/08	Updating Memorandum of Second and Third Respondents incorporating:	1382
		Report of the Fishery Assessment Plenary, May 2007; and	1384
		Cabinet Policy Committee Paper "Shared Fisheries report back on consultation and next steps", October 2007	1401